Nomenclature of the nothogenus names ×*Graptophytum* Gossot, ×*Graptoveria* Gossot, and ×*Pachyveria* Haage & Schmidt (Crassulaceae)

Gideon F. Smith^{1,2}, Estrela Figueiredo^{1,2}, Margrit Bischofberger³ & Urs Eggli⁴

- 1. Department of Botany, P.O. Box 77000, Nelson Mandela University, Port Elizabeth, 6031 South Africa.
- 2. Centre for Functional Ecology, Departamento de Ciências da Vida, Universidade de Coimbra,
- 3001-455 Coimbra, Portugal. (email: smithgideon1@gmail.com; epnfigueiredo@gmail.com).
- 3. Guggenbuehlstrasse 20, 8355 Aadorf, Switzerland. (email: margrit.bischofberger@enersol.ch).
- 4. Sukkulenten-Sammlung / Grün Stadt Zürich, Mythenquai 88, CH-8002 Zürich, Switzerland.

(email: urs.eggli@zuerich.ch).

Summary: Cultivars established in the three nothogenera ×Graptophytum Gossot, ×Graptoveria Gossot, and ×Pachyveria Haage & Schmidt (Crassulaceae) have entered specialist and general horticulture, and are increasingly and widely cultivated, especially in mild-climate parts of the world. However, uncertainty has existed regarding the place of valid publication and authorship of two of these nothogenus names ×*Graptophytum* Gossot and \times Graptoveria Gossot. We show that both names were validly published in a littleknown book, Liste des Plantes Grasses sauf Cactées du Jardin Botanique des Cèdres, which was published by J. Marnier-Lapostolle in 1949. Both names should be attributed to [Pierre] Gossot. ×Pachyveria was validly published by Haage & Schmidt in 1926. Notes are included on the author attribution 'Haage & Schmidt'.

Zusammenfassung: Die in den drei Hybridgattungen ×Graptophytum Gossot, ×Graptoveria Gossot und ×Pachvveria Haage & Schmidt (Crassulaceae) etablierten Sorten haben den spezialisierten sowie allgemeinen Gartenbau erobert und werden zunehmend und weit kultiviert, besonders in den milden Klimaregionen der Welt. Jedoch waren Ort und Autorschaft der gültigen Publikation von zwei dieser Hybridgattungen, ×Graptophytum Gossot und ×Graptoveria Gossot, bisher ungeklärt. Wir zeigen, dass beide Namen in einem wenig bekannten Buch gültig publiziert wurden, in "Liste des Plantes Grasses sauf Cactées du Jardin Botanique des Cèdres", das 1949 von J. Marnier-Lapostolle veröffentlicht wurde. Beide Namen sollten [Pierre] Gossot zugeschrieben werden. ×*Pachyveria* wurde von Haage & Schmidt 1926 ungültig publiziert. Die Autorenangabe "Haage & Schmidt" wird kommentiert.

Introduction

Representatives of several genera of the Crassulaceae have been deliberately or incidentally



Figure 1. The flowers of \times *Graptoveria* are intermediate between those of their parents; *Graptopetalum* species have star-shaped flowers, while the petals of *Echeveria* species are erect. The flowers of the hybrid have ascending petals and, as in *Graptopetalum*, the filaments are outcurved between the petals. Flowers of \times *Graptoveria* 'Galathea' are shown here.

Photograph: Margrit Bischofberger.

Table 1. Nothogenus names included in Marnier-Lapostolle (1949) that involve the three crassuloid genera *Echeveria*, *Graptopetalum*, and *Pachyphytum*. Information is transcribed verbatim, except that the use of upper case typescript for genus names, and first-letter upper case in epithets honouring a person was standardised to lower case in line with current practice.

#	Nothogenus name	Authorship recorded for nothogenus name	Comment after nothogenus name	Hybrid formulae applied to included hybrids	Authorship recorded for hybrid formulae	Comment after hybrid formula
1.	×Echepetalum	Gos.	n. nud.	$Echepetalum imes haworthioides^1$	Gos.	-
				Echepetalum ×serpens	Gos.	n. nud.
2.	× <i>Echephytum</i>	Gos.	-	$Echephytum imes albo-mucronatum^2$	Gos. Jacobs.	Hyb.
				Echephytum ×paradoxum ³	Gos.	Hyb.
				Echephytum ×perpusillum	Gos.	n. nud. Hyb.
				Echephytum ×scheideckeri ⁴	-	n. nud. Hyb.
				Echephytum ×sebaceum	Gos.	n. nud. Hyb.
				$Echephytum imes sempervivoides^5$	Gos.	Hyb.
3.	×Graptophytum	Gos.	-	Graptophytum ×marnieri ⁶	Gos.	n. nud. Hyb.
4.	×Graptoveria	Gos.	-	Graptoveria ×calva ⁷	Gos.	n. nud. Hyb.
5.	Pachyveria ⁹	-	-	Pachyveria ×clavifolia	(Bgr.) Jacobs	Hyb.
				Pachyveria ×clavifolia var. cristata	hort.	-
				Pachyveria ×fusifera	hort.	Hyb.
				Pachyveria ×glauca	Haage et Schmidt.	Hyb.
				Pachyveria ×glossoides	Gos.	Hyb.
				Pachyveria ×guionettii	Gos.	n. nud. Hyb.
				Pachyveria ×pachyphytoides ⁸	Guill.	-
				Pachyveria ×pachyphytoides var. muelleriana	Guill.	-

¹Parents given as *Echeveria agavoides* × *Graptopetalum weinbergii*.

²= Urbinia purpusii Rose.

³Parents given as *Echeveria setosa* \times *Pachyphytum oviferum*.

 4 = Pachyveria ×scheideckeri (hort.) E.Walth.

⁵Parents given as *Echeveria perelegans* × *Pachyphytum linguaefolium*.

 $^6\mathrm{Parents}$ given as Graptopetalum amethystinum \times Pachyphytum uniflorum.

⁷Parents given as *Graptopetalum arizonicum* × *Echeveria pulvinata*.

⁸Parents given as Pachyphytum bracteosum × Echeveria gibbiflora.

⁹Note omission of '×', or an equivalent, in front of the nothogenus name. However, '*Pachyveria*' was clearly treated as a nothogenus by Gossot as he included eight nothospecies in it with '×' inserted before the nothospecific epithets.

hybridised with the aim, at least partly, to produce, multiply, and distribute plants that have horticulturally superior characteristics (see for example Rowley, 2017: 131). Examples of such crossing experiments include the use of species from the three New World genera *Echeveria* DC., *Graptopetalum* Rose, and *Pachyphytum* Link, Klotzsch & Otto. The nothogenus names \times Graptoveria Gossot [not G.D.Rowley; see below] (Figures 1 and 2) for hybrids between representatives of *Echeveria* and *Graptopetalum*, and \times Graptophytum Gossot (Figures 3 and 4) for hybrids between representatives of *Graptopetalum* and *Pachyphytum*, are in wide use. However, there has been uncertainty as



Figure 2. Vegetative variability in \times Graptoveria. A \times G. 'Margarete Reppin'; B \times G. 'Spirit of '76';C an unnamed \times Graptoveria; D \times G. 'Iona'.Photographs: Margit Bischofberger.

to the authorship and place of valid publication of the two nothogenus names.

We show that both \times *Graptoveria* and \times *Graptophytum* must be ascribed to [Pierre] Gossot, who established the two names in Marnier-Lapostolle (1949) in identical ways, on pp. 23 and 27, respectively. In the past "G.D.Rowley" was regarded as having been the author of \times *Graptoveria* (Jacobsen & Rowley, 1958: 75), while \times *Graptophytum* is apparently sometimes regarded as not having been validly published, and it is omitted from, inter alia, The International Plant Names Index (IPNI). Up to the late-1940s, and over the preceding more

or less 20 years, Gossot had done considerable work on the hybridisation and selection of crassuloid species (see for example Gossot, 1938).

The nomenclature of \times *Pachyveria* Haage & Schmidt, for hybrids between *Echeveria* and *Pachyphytum* (Figures 5 and 6), is also discussed, with notes on the author attribution 'Haage & Schmidt'.

Background

Marnier-Lapostolle (1949) is a published list of succulents, excluding cacti, grown at Les Cèdres on the Côte d'Azur (see Smith & Figueiredo,



Figure 3. The flowers of \times *Graptophytum* are characterised by fairly big sepals, inherited from the *Pachyphytum* parent, and spreading petals as well as outcurving filaments recalling the *Graptopetalum* parent. At left: $\times G$. 'Anita'; at right an unnamed \times *Graptophytum*. Photographs: Margrit Bischofberger.



Figure 4. Two contrasting hybrids of ×*Graptophytum*. At left: ×*G*. 'Amphitryon'; at right: ×*G*. 'Anita'. Photographs: Margrit Bischofberger.

2013: 68–79). In the "PRÉFACE" to his work, Marnier-Lapostolle (1949) states that: "Nous avons à remercier les diverses personnes qui nous ont aidé pour établir cette liste, entre autres MM. GUILLAUMIN, JACOBSEN et GOSSOT." ["We have to thank the various people who helped us to draw up this list, among others, Messrs Guillaumin, Jacobsen and Gossot."] Gossot, as well as [Prof. André] Guillaumin and [Dr Hermann J.H.] Jacobsen, for that matter, therefore assisted Marnier-Lapostolle with compiling the list, and Gossot, perhaps inadvertently, validly published some nothogenus names in the Crassulaceae. No descriptions aimed at validating novel plant names are included the work. Table 1 provides a list of the nothogenus names as included in Marnier-Lapostolle (1949) that involve the three crassuloid genera *Echeveria*, *Graptopetalum*, and *Pachyphytum*, with which we are concerned in this paper.

All hybrids between the same parent taxa must bear the same name, regardless of which parent is male or female. From Table 1 it is clear that Gossot provided two names for each of the genus combinations possible between *Echeveria* and *Graptopetalum*, and *Echeveria* and *Pachyphytum*, perhaps depending on whether he had knowledge of which genus representative was the pollen donor, and which one was the seed parent. Therefore, for *Echeveria* × *Graptopetalum* he catalogued both:

×*Echepetalum* and,

×Graptoveria.

For *Echeveria* \times *Pachyphytum* he catalogued both:

×Echephytum and,

 \times *Pachyveria* (in the latter case with ' \times ', or an equivalent, omitted in error).

In the case of *Graptopetalum* × *Pachyphytum* he catalogued only one nothogenus name, namely: ×*Graptophytum*.

One of these five nothogenus names, ×*Echep*etalum, is followed by the statement "n. nud." (Marnier-Lapostolle, 1949: 23, and see Table 1, first row), an abbreviation that is not elaborated on in Marnier-Lapostolle (1949). In the absence of an explanation of what Gossot in Marnier-Lapostolle (1949) meant by "n. nud.", we take it to have meant "nomen nudum", as is common practice. This is generally used as an expression of taxonomic doubt by an author, or reflects the advanceuse of the name, which is intended to be validated at a later date. This would then make this 'name' (×*Echepetalum*) not validly published, as it was simply included in the book in anticipation of later validating the name; Gossot himself therefore did not accept the publication in that work (Marnier-Lapostolle, 1949: 23) of \times Echepetalum. For the combination *Echeveria* \times *Graptopetalum* only ×Graptoveria should therefore be assessed to determine whether it was validly published, as ×Echepetalum evidently was not.

Gossot also used the abbreviation "n. nud." in various other places in the list of Crassulaceae included in Marnier-Lapostolle (1949), notably after the hybrid formulae and their authorships (see Table 1, last column). Gossot therefore listed the names of the nothospecies cultivated at Marnier-Lapostolle's garden in 1949, but expressly did not want to validate those that he regarded as new and undescribed.

Nomenclatural notes on $\times Graptoveria$ Gossot

On p. 27 of Marnier-Lapostolle (1949), the name \times *Graptoveria* is ascribed to "Gos.", without a reference to where the name might have been previously published. The single entity that was included under this nothogenus name, "Graptoveria \times *calva*" was noted as "Gos. n. nud. Hyb."; the parentage of the hybrid was given as *Graptopetalum arizonicum* and *Echeveria pulvinata*. To validly publish a nothogeneric name "...a statement of the names of the parent genera or subdivisions of genera..." is sufficient (see the *International Code of Nomenclature for algae*,



Figure 5. The majority of the hybrids between representatives of *Echeveria* and *Pachyphytum* involve species of *P*. sect. *Pachyphytum*. The sepals of the flowers of such hybrids are quite large—less so than those of the *Pachyphytum* parent, but much larger than the sepals of most *Echeveria* species. Photograph: Margrit Bischofberger.

fungi, and plants (ICN): 149, Article H.9.1.; Mc-Neill et al., 2012). When Gossot therefore gave the parents of the included Graptoveria ×calva as Graptopetalum arizonicum and Echeveria pulvinata, the nothogenus name ×Graptoveria was validly published and should be ascribed to Gossot.

We were unable to find whether, and where, Gossot, or anyone else for that matter, may have validly published the name \times *Graptoveria* before the appearance of Marnier-Lapostolle's booklet in 1949. In Marnier-Lapostolle (1949: 27) the nothogeneric name \times *Graptoveria* appeared without a description.

Rowley in Jacobsen & Rowley (1958: 75) republished the nothogenus name ×*Graptoveria* G.D.Rowley as a name for a "gen. hybr. nov." for

hybrids between Graptopetalum and Echeveria, and furnished it with the following brief Latin statement: "Hybridae inter Graptopetalum Rose et Echeveria D.C.". Note that the ICN states that for a nothogeneric name to be validly published "...no description or diagnosis is necessary..." (Mc-Neill et al., 2012: 149. Article H.9.1.). It seems that Jacobsen & Rowley (1958) were unaware that Gossot earlier published the nothogenus name ×Graptoveria in Marnier-Lapostolle (1949), as they did not reference this publication. Rowley in Jacobsen & Rowley (1958: 75) included ×Graptoveria calva (Gossot) G.D.Rowley and $\times G$. haworthioides (Gossot) G.D.Rowley in the nothogenus, and additionally stated that a further nothospecies "Probably also referable here is Echeveria caerulescens Gossot" (see also Van Keppel, 1964: 180, 1980: 29, 1981).

Rowley (1980: 153), following Jacobsen (1974: 245), corrected his earlier work in Jacobsen & Rowley (1958) and gave the author and place of publication of the name ×*Graptoveria* as Gossot in Marnier-Lapostolle (1949: 27).

Van Keppel (1980: 29) cites the authority of the nothogenus \times Graptoveria as "Gossot ex van Keppel". We can see no reason why Van Keppel's name should be added to the author citation, given that Gossot validly published the name \times Graptoveria in Marnier-Lapostolle (1949). Further, Van Keppel's statement (Van Keppel, 1980: 28) that "I [Van Keppel] first described and characterised this artificial genus, based on the four cultivars I was able to identify" seems superfluous, as Gossot first published the name some 30 years earlier and characterised it by unambiguously listing a cultivar, with parentage stated, under the nothogenus name.

IPNI attributes the nothogenus name \times *Graptoveria* to Rowley (in Jacobsen & Rowley, 1958: 75), with the statement "sine descr.", a view with which Eggli (2003a: 134) concurred.

Nomenclatural notes on ×*Graptophytum* Gossot

In the case of hybrids between representatives of *Graptopetalum* and *Pachyphytum*, Gossot catalogued a single nothogenus name only, namely ×*Graptophytum*. For this nothogenus *Graptophytum* ×*marnieri* was listed, with its parents given as *Graptopetalum amethystinum* and *Pachyphytum uniflorum*. This nothogeneric name was therefore also validly published. Based on Marnier-Lapostolle (1949: 27), the nothogenus name ×*Graptophytum* is ascribed to Gossot by Eggli (2003b: 134). Gossot, in Marnier-Lapostolle (1949: 27), established this name in a way identical to how he [Gossot] established the name ×*Graptoveria*. The nothogeneric name ×*Graptophytum* has to date not been included in IPNI.

Nomenclatural notes on ×*Pachyveria* Haage & Schmidt

The firm Haage & Schmidt was founded in 1861 by Johann Nicolaus Haage (1826–1878). with Ernst Schmidt joining the firm as a partner in 1862. After the death of J.N. Haage, Carl Schmidt (not a son of Ernst Schmidt) became the owner; Carl Schmidt died in 1919. His son Curt Werner Schmidt took over the business, and after he died in 1921, his widow, Martha Luise Schmidt carried on with the business activities. In 1922 she married Horst Leopold Ratz and henceforth was known as Martha Luise Ratz. In 1926, when ×Pachyveria was described, Ms M.L. Ratz was therefore the owner of the firm (see Schalldach, 2011; Wikipedia, 2017). However, there is no indication that she or her husband [H.L. Ratz] contributed in any way to the entries in the 1926 and 1928 Haage & Schmidt catalogues. Rather, it is very likely that these catalogues were anonymously compiled by staff of the firm. We therefore conclude that the authorship of any novelties validly published in the 1926 catalogue (as well as the 1928 catalogue for that matter) should be attributed simply to "Haage & Schmidt", as has been done in IPNI, rather than to "Hort. Haage & Schmidt". Inclusion of "hort." or "Hort.", with the "h" capitalised, in an author citation most often refers to a name used in horticulture that was not initially validly published, and only validated later, which is usually indicated by inclusion of the word "ex" followed by the name(s) of the validating author(s) after "h(H)ort.".

For Echeveria × Pachyphytum, Gossot in Marnier-Lapostolle (1949) catalogued both his own ×Echephytum (p. 24), as well as [×]Pachyve*ria* (p. 29–30), in the latter case with ' \times ', or an equivalent, omitted in error before the nothogenus name (see Footnote ⁹ to Table 1). Significantly, Gossot did not list himself [as 'Gos.'] as the author of *×Pachyveria*, as he did for all the other nothogeneric names (see Table 1, third column), as he was aware that *×Pachyveria* had been published earlier (see next paragraph). He therefore did not publish a superfluous name, '×Pachyveria Gossot'. Both *×Echephytum* Gossot and *×Pachyveria* Haage & Schmidt refer to hybrid material obtained from the same genus parentage (see 'Conclusion. Nomenclature of ×Pachyveria Haage & Schmidt', below).

The nothogenus name $\times Pachyveria$ was validly published earlier by Haage & Schmidt (1926: 193; Eggli, 2003c: 196) when they stated under the entry for "**Pachyveria glauca** (H. &



Figure 6. Vegetative variability in ×Pachyveria. A ×P. 'Elaine'; B ×P. 'Dr. Cornelius'; C ×P. 'Glauca';
D ×P. 'Mrs. Coombes'.P

S.)", "Kreuzung zwischen Pachyphytum und Echeveria" (English: "Hybrid between Pachyphytum and Echeveria"). Eight years later Walther (1934: 53) noted that the name Pachyveria was first used by Haage & Schmidt in "...one of their last published catalogs ... ", without indicating which one, and proceeded to "...legitimize[-d]..." this nothogenus name. However, ×Pachyveria did not require "...legitimiz[e]-ing..." by Walther (1934: 53). Furthermore, four years before Walther (1934) appeared, Berger (1930: 481, 482) had already referenced this nothogenus name indicating Echeveria and Pachyphytum as the parents, an act that would have established the nothogenus name, had Haage & Schmidt (1926: 193) not done so earlier. Interestingly, Walther (1934) also omitted an '×', or an equivalent, before the nothogenus name,

consistently referring to it as "Pachyveria".

Conclusion

1. Nomenclature of ×*Graptoveria* Gossot ×*Graptoveria* Gossot in Marnier-Lapostolle (1949: 27). Jacobsen (1974: 245); Eggli (2003a: 134).

<u>Parentage</u>:

Echeveria DC., Prodr. syst. nat. regni veg. 3: 401 (1828).

Graptopetalum Rose in Contrib. US Nat. Herb. Smithson. Inst. 13: 296 (1911).

<u>Synonyms</u>:

×Graptoveria G.D.Rowley in [Rowley & Jacobsen] Nat. Cact. & Succ. Journ. 13: 75 (1958). Jacobsen (1986: 496).

×Echenesia P.V.Heath in Calyx 4(4): 132 [Byrnesia Rose (1922) as Brynesia, sic] (1994).

Nomenclatural note:

The nothogenus designation '×*Echepetalum*' for the combination *Echeveria* × *Graptopetalum* is not a "name" in the sense of the *ICN*; see McNeill *et al.*, 2012: 7, 32, Articles 6.3. and 12.1, respectively) as it was not validly published (see above).

2. Nomenclature of ×Graptophytum Gossot

×*Graptophytum* Gossot in Marnier-Lapostolle (1949: 27).

Parentage:

Graptopetalum Rose in Contrib. US Nat. Herb. Smithson. Inst. 13: 296 (1911).

Pachyphytum Link, Klotzsch & Otto in Allg. Gartenzeitung 9(2): 9 (1841). Britton & Rose (1903: 11).

3. Nomenclature of ×*Pachyveria* Haage & Schmidt

×Pachyveria Haage & Schmidt in Haupt-Verzeichnis Samen Pfl., Erfurt **1926**: 193 (1926). Haage & Schmidt (**1928**: 205); Eggli (2003c: 196).

Parentage:

Echeveria DC., Prodr. syst. nat. regni veg. 3: 401 (1828).

Pachyphytum Link, Klotzsch & Otto in Allg. Gartenzeitung **9**(2): 9 (1841). Britton & Rose (1903: 11).

Synonyms:

×*Echephytum* Gossot in Marnier-Lapostolle (1949: 24). [See Jacobsen 1974: 616, 1986: 348.]

Acknowledgements

Michael Greulich and Nicholas Turland (both Germany), Anton Hofer and Michelle Price (both Switzerland), and John McNeill and Roy Mottram (both United Kingdom), are thanked for kindly checking for, and providing, hard-to-find literature from their personal and institutional botanical libraries and archives.

Anonymous referees are thanked for comments on the manuscript.

Literature cited

- BERGER, A. (1930). Crassulaceae. In: A. ENGLER & K. PRANTL (EDS), *Die Naturlichen Pflanzenfamilien*, ed. 2. Angiospermae: Reihe Podostemonales. — Reihe Rosales, Unterreihe Saxifraginae. Redigiert von H. HARMS. 18a: 402–412. Verlag von Wilhelm Engelmann, Leipzig.
- BRITTON, N.L. & ROSE, J.N. (1903). New or noteworthy North American Crassulaceae. [Issued separately, September 12, 1903]. Bulletin of the New York Botanical Garden 3: 1–45. [see: https://www.biodiversitylibrary.org/item/9729 3#page/27/mode/1up].

- DE CANDOLLE, A.P. (1828). Prodromus systematis naturalis regni vegetabilis, sive enumeratio contracta ordinum, generum, specierumque plantarum huc usque cognitarium, juxta methodi naturalis, normas digesta. Auctore AUG. PYRAMO DE CANDOLLE. Pars tertia. Sistens Calyciflorarum Ordines XXVI. 3: 401. Sumptibus Sociorum Treuttel et Würtz, Parisiis. [see: https://www.biodiversitylibrary.org/item/7152 #page/412/mode/1up].
- EGGLI, U. (2003a). ×Graptoveria. In: U. EGGLI, (ED.), Illustrated handbook of succulent plants: Crassulaceae: 134. Springer Verlag, Berlin.
- EGGLI, U. (2003b). ×Graptophytum. In: U. EGGLI, (ED.), Illustrated handbook of succulent plants: Crassulaceae: 134. Springer Verlag, Berlin.
- EGGLI, U. (2003c). ×Pachyveria. In: U. EGGLI, (ED.), Illustrated handbook of succulent plants: Crassulaceae: 196. Springer Verlag, Berlin.
- GOSSOT, P. (1938). Nouveaux hybrides. Notre Vallée. Bulletin du Cercle des naturalistes Corbellois. No. 24–25 (July–December): 33–38.
- HAAGE & SCHMIDT. (1926). 8. Verschiedene sukkulente Pflanzen (Fettpflanzen). [Pachyveria glauca]. Pp. 191–193. Haage & Schmidt Gärtnerei, Samenbau, Samenhandlung: Hauptverzeichnis über Samen und Pflanzen mit Verkaufsbedingungen. Offsetdruck Arthur Kirchner, Erfurt.
- HAAGE & SCHMIDT. (1928 [January]). Verschiedene sukkulente Pflanzen. [Pachyveria glauca]. Pp. 203–205. Haage & Schmidt Gärtnerei, Samenbau, Samenhandlung: Hauptverzeichnis über Samen und Pflanzen. Haage & Schmidt, Erfurt. [see: https://archive.org/stream/HaageSchmidt1928 #page/n205/mode/2up].
- HEATH, P.V. (1994). The history of *Byrnesia weinbergii* (Shepherd) Rose. *Calyx* 4(4): 131–133.
- JACOBSEN, H. [J.H.] (1974). Lexicon of succulent plants. Short descriptions, habitats and synonymy of succulent plants other than Cactaceae. 2nd edition. Blandford Press, Poole, Dorset. [English edition, based on: JACOBSEN, H.[J.H.]. (1970). Das Sukkulentenlexikon. Kurze Beschreibung, Herkunftsangaben und Synonymie der sukkulenten Pflanzen mit Ausnahme der Cactaceae. Veb Gustav Fischer Verlag, Jena].
- JACOBSEN, H. [J.H.] (1986). A handbook of succulent plants. Descriptions, synonyms and cultural details for succulents other than Cactaceae. Volume II. Ficus to Zygophyllum. Blandford Press, Poole, Dorset.

- JACOBSEN, H.[J.H.] & ROWLEY, G.D. (1958). Some name changes in succulent plants. Part IV. *The National Cactus & Succulent Journal* 13: 75–78.
- KLOTZSCH, J.F. (1841). Beschreibung einer neuen mexicanischen Pflanze. Pachyphytum bracteosum. In: C.F. OTTO & A.G. DIETRICH, Allgemeine Gartenzeitung (Otto & Dietrich) 9(2): 9–11. [see: http://www.biodiversitylibrary.org/ item/51984#page/10/mode/1up].
- MARNIER-LAPOSTOLLE, J. ([November] 1949). Liste des Plantes Grasses sauf Cactées du Jardin Botanique des Cèdres. St.-Jean-Cap-Ferrat (Alpes-Maritimes). Liste établie par J. MARNIER-LAPOSTOLLE, France.
- MCNEILL, J., BARRIE, F.R., BUCK, W.R., DEMOULIN, V., GREUTER, W., HAWKSWORTH, D.L., HEREN-DEEN, P.S., KNAPP, S., MARHOLD, K., PRADO, J., PRUD'HOMME VAN REINE, W.F., SMITH, G.F., WIERSEMA, J.H. & TURLAND, N.J. (EDS). (2012). International Code of Nomenclature for algae, fungi, and plants (Melbourne Code) adopted by the Eighteenth International Botanical Congress Melbourne, Australia, July 2011. Koeltz Scientific Books, Königstein. [Regnum Vegetabile 154].
- ROSE, J.N. (1911). Studies of Mexican and Central American plants—No. 7. Crassulaceae. Graptopetalum, a new genus. Contributions from the United States National Herbarium. Smithsonian Institution 13: 296. Plate 52, Figure 55. [see: see: http://www.biodiversitylibrary.org/ page/368315#page/414/mode/1up].
- Rose, J.N. (1922). Byrnesia weinbergii. Weinberg's Stonecrop. Native country unknown. Family Crassulaceae. Orpine Family. Addisonia 7: 37–38, Plate 243. [see: https://www.biodiversitylibrary.org/item/24650#page/85/mode /1up].

- ROWLEY, G.D. (1980). Name that succulent. Keys to the families and genera of succulent plants in cultivation. Stanley Thornes (Publishers) Ltd, Cheltenham.
- ROWLEY, G.D. (2017). Succulents in cultivation breeding new cultivars. The British Cactus & Succulent Society, Hornchurch, Essex.
- SCHALLDACH, I. (2011). Die Familie Haage—325 Jahre Gärtnereigeschichte. In: M. BAUMANN & S. RASSLOFF (EDS), *Blumenstadt Erfurt*. Sutton-Verlag, Erfurt (Germany).
- SMITH, G.F. & FIGUEIREDO, E. (2013). Succulent paradise. Twelve great gardens of the world. Struik Lifestyle, an imprint of Random House Struik, Cape Town.
- VAN KEPPEL, J.C. (1964). ×Graptoveria cv. 'Caerulescens' (Gossot). Succulenta 43: 180– 181.
- VAN KEPPEL, J.C. (1980). An account of the hybrid genus ×Graptoveria (Graptopetalum Rose × Echeveria DC) Part 1. The National Cactus & Succulent Journal **35**(2): 28–31.
- VAN KEPPEL, J.C. (1981). An account of the hybrid genus ×Graptoveria (Graptopetalum Rose × Echeveria DC) Part 2. The National Cactus & Succulent Journal **36**(1): 13–17.
- WALTHER, E. (1934). Echeveria hybrids. A. With Pachyphytum. Cactus and Succulent Journal (U.S.) 6: 53–56.
- WIKIPEDIA. (2017). German entry on "Kakteen Haage". Accessed 17 December 2017.